

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
8 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

9 JOYCETTE GOODWIN, an  
10 individual, on behalf of herself, all  
11 others similarly situated, and the  
12 general public,

13 Plaintiff,

14 v.

15 WALGREEN CO., an Illinois  
16 Corporation,

17 Defendant.  
18  
19

Case No. 2:23-cv-00147-HDV-PD

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
ORDER<sup>1</sup>

20  
21  
22 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

23 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,  
24 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public  
25 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be  
26

27 <sup>1</sup> This Stipulated Protective Order is substantially based on the model protective  
28 order provided under Magistrate Judge Patricia Donahue's Procedures.

1 warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter  
2 the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order  
3 does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and  
4 that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the  
5 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the  
6 applicable legal principles.

7 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

8 This action is likely to involve confidential information, including trade  
9 secrets, customer and pricing lists and other valuable research, development,  
10 commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which special  
11 protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than  
12 prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials  
13 and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial  
14 information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other  
15 confidential research, development, or commercial information (including  
16 information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise  
17 generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise  
18 protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions,  
19 or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the  
20 prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to  
21 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure  
22 that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in  
23 preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the  
24 litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is  
25 justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be  
26 designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated  
27 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public  
28 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this

1 case.

2  
3 C. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER SEAL

4 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this  
5 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information  
6 under seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and  
7 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to  
8 file material under seal.

9 There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial  
10 proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions,  
11 good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. See Kamakana v. City and  
12 County of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2006), Phillips v. Gen. Motors  
13 Corp., 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2002), Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electrics,  
14 Inc., 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders require  
15 good cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling reasons  
16 with proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with respect to  
17 Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere designation  
18 of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not—without the  
19 submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the material  
20 sought to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or otherwise  
21 protectable—constitute good cause.

22 Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then  
23 compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the  
24 relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected.  
25 See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2010). For each  
26 item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced under  
27 seal in connection with a dispositive motion or trial, the party seeking protection  
28

1 must articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal  
2 justification, for the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting  
3 the application to file documents under seal must be provided by declaration.

4 Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in  
5 its entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If  
6 documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting only  
7 the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document, shall  
8 be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their entirety  
9 should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

10  
11 2. DEFINITIONS

12 2.1 Action: *Goodwin v. Walgreen Co.*, Case No. 2:23-cv-00147-HDV-PD.

13 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation  
14 of information or items under this Order.

15 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of  
16 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for  
17 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the  
18 Good Cause Statement.

19 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as  
20 their support staff).

21 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or  
22 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as  
23 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

24 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless  
25 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,  
26 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or  
27 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

1           2.7   Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter  
2   pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as  
3   an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

4           2.8   House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.  
5   House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside  
6   counsel.

7           2.9   Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or  
8   other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

9           2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party  
10   to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have  
11   appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which  
12   has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

13          2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,  
14   employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their  
15   support staffs).

16          2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or  
17   Discovery Material in this Action.

18          2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation  
19   support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or  
20   demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)  
21   and their employees and subcontractors.

22          2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
23   designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

24          2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material  
25   from a Producing Party.

1     3.     SCOPE

2             The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only  
3 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or  
4 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or  
5 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or  
6 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

7             Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the  
8 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

9  
10     4.     DURATION

11             FINAL DISPOSITION of the action is defined as the conclusion of any  
12 appellate proceedings, or, if no appeal is taken, when the time for filing of an appeal  
13 has run. Except as set forth below, the terms of this protective order apply through  
14 FINAL DISPOSITION of the action. The parties may stipulate that they will be  
15 contractually bound by the terms of this agreement beyond FINAL DISPOSITION,  
16 but will have to file a separate action for enforcement of the agreement once all  
17 proceedings in this case are complete.

18             Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as  
19 CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or introduced  
20 as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all  
21 members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by  
22 specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance  
23 of the trial. See Kamakana, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing “good cause”  
24 showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons”  
25 standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, for  
26 such materials, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the  
27 commencement of the trial.  
28

1       5.     DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

2             5.1     Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

3     Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under  
4     this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that  
5     qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for  
6     protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written  
7     communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items,  
8     or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably  
9     within the ambit of this Order.

10            Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations  
11     that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper  
12     purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose  
13     unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating  
14     Party to sanctions.

15            If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it  
16     designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must  
17     promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

18            5.2     Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in  
19     this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise  
20     stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection  
21     under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or  
22     produced.

23            Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

24            (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic  
25     documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial  
26     proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend  
27     "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that  
28

1 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page  
2 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected  
3 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

4 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection  
5 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
6 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and  
7 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be  
8 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the  
9 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which  
10 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before  
11 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the  
12 "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a  
13 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing  
14 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate  
15 markings in the margins).

16 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify  
17 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition  
18 all protected testimony.

19 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for  
20 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the  
21 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend  
22 "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants  
23 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected  
24 portion(s).

25 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent  
26 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive  
27 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material.

1 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable  
2 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this  
3 Order.

4  
5 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a  
7 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's  
8 Scheduling Order.

9 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute  
10 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

11 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on  
12 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose  
13 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may  
14 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived  
15 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the  
16 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing  
17 Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

18  
19 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

20 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is  
21 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this  
22 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such  
23 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the  
24 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a  
25 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL  
26 DISPOSITION).

1 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a  
2 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons  
3 authorized under this Order.

4 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless  
5 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a  
6 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated  
7 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

8 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well  
9 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary  
10 to disclose the information for this Action;

11 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the  
12 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

13 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom  
14 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the  
15 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

16 (d) the court and its personnel;

17 (e) court reporters and their staff;

18 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional  
19 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have  
20 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

21 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a  
22 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

23 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the  
24 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary, provided they sign the  
25 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise  
26 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed  
27 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may  
28 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except

as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED  
IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT  
TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party’s confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

#### 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed

Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

#### 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

#### 12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this

1 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any  
2 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

3 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
4 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may  
5 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the  
6 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material  
7 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information  
8 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

9  
10 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

11 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60  
12 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return  
13 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in  
14 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,  
15 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
16 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving  
17 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same  
18 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies  
19 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or  
20 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,  
21 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any  
22 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to  
23 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing  
24 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert  
25 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such  
26 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or  
27 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in  
28

Section 4 (DURATION).

14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: November 13, 2023

/s/ Ronald A. Marron

Ronald A. Marron

*Attorney for Plaintiff*

DATED: November 13, 2023

/s/ Erik Mortensen

Erik Mortensen

*Attorneys for Defendant*

**ATTESTATION PURSUANT TO CIVIL L.R. 5-4.3.4**

The filer attests that the other signatories listed, on whose behalf the filing is also submitted, are registered CM/ECF filers and concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.

Dated: November 13, 2023

/s/ Ronald A. Marron

Ronald A. Marron

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: November 16, 2023



Patricia Donahue

United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of  
\_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury  
that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that  
was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California  
on [date] in the case of *Goodwin v. Walgreen Co.*, Case No. 2:23-cv-00147-HDV-  
PD. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated  
Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could  
expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly  
promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject  
to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict  
compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for  
the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this  
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after  
termination of this action. I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or  
type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number] as  
my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any  
proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_